

CALGARY BOARD OF EDUCATION

Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Board of Trustees (the “Board”) held in the Multipurpose Room, Education Centre, 1221 – 8th Street SW, Calgary, Alberta on Tuesday, October 2, 2012 at 3:00 p.m.

MEETING ATTENDANCE

Board of Trustees:

Trustee P. Cochrane, Chair
Trustee C. Bazinet
Trustee J. Bowen-Eyre
Trustee L. Ferguson
Trustee P. King
Trustee G. Lane
Trustee S. Taylor

Administration:

Ms. N. Johnson, Chief Superintendent of Schools
Mr. D. Stevenson, Deputy Chief Superintendent of Schools
Mr. F. Coppinger, Superintendent, Facilities and Environmental Services
Ms. C. Faber, Superintendent, Learning Innovation
Ms. D. Lewis, Superintendent, Learning Services
Ms. D. Meyers, Superintendent, Finance and Supply Chain Services
Mr. K. Peterson, Acting Superintendent, Human Resources
Mr. R. Peter, Chief Communications Officer
Ms. L. Safran, Acting General Counsel
Ms. J. Barkway, Corporate Secretary
Ms. D. Perrier, Recording Secretary

Stakeholder Representatives:

Mr. B. Anderson, Canadian Union of Public Employees, Local 40
Ms. S. Anderson, Elementary School Principals' Association
Mr. F. Bruseker, Alberta Teachers' Association, Local 38
Mr. K. Connelly, Principals' Association for Adolescent Learners (PAALS)
Mr. F. Fuchs, Calgary Board of Education Staff Association
Ms. R. Morrison, Elementary School Principals' Association
Ms. C. O'Connor, Elementary School Principals' Association

1 | CALL TO ORDER, NATIONAL ANTHEM AND WELCOME

Chair Cochrane called the meeting to order at 2:58 p.m. on the Link, following a musical presentation by grade 6 students from Connaught School. The students led the singing of O Canada.

The meeting continued in the Multipurpose Room. Chair Cochrane acknowledged and welcomed representatives from the aforementioned organizations.

2 | **CONSIDERATION/APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Ms. Barkway noted the proposed changes to the Agenda included the additions of Item 4.1, Vincent Massey School Presentation, and Item 7.1, Update on Disclosure of Expenses and Open Government; and Item 8.3, Annual Monitoring - Governance Culture and Board-Chief Superintendent Relationship Policies, was pulled from the Consent Agenda, to be dealt with immediately following the Consent Agenda.

MOVED by Trustee Taylor:

THAT the Agenda be amended by the addition of Item 7.2, Response to Question.

Trustee Taylor clarified that she had submitted a question on behalf of a constituent, in relation to recess and physical education policy. She noted that if the motion were approved to add the item to the agenda, her intent would be to put forward a motion that the Board approves expending resources to respond to the question.

Trustees debated the motion, which is summarized as follows:

- Reference was made of Board policy B/CSR-2. Single Unit Control, sub-policy 2.3. In response to a trustee request for information, the Chief Superintendent noted that significant resources would be required to respond. The intended request today would be to ask whether or not the Board approves the expenditure of time to respond to the specific question.
- Comments were shared about the ongoing development of a process and form for handling trustee information requests.
- The belief was shared that the CBE website offers a process to parents who are seeking answers to their questions, and puts forward a chain of organizational hierarchy that they should follow to get a response to their concerns and complaints.
- A trustee expressed the opinion that it is important for the Board to discuss the matter of how to get these types of questions answered. With respect to the comment about the process to be followed by parents with questions, in this particular matter the constituent asking the question requested privacy and anonymity.

Chair Cochrane clarified the motion, which is to amend the Agenda by the addition of Item 7.2, and she called for the vote.

The motion was
DEFEATED.

In favour: Trustee Bazinet
Trustee Taylor

Opposed: Trustee Bowen-Eyre
Trustee Cochrane
Trustee Ferguson
Trustee King
Trustee Lane

MOVED by Trustee Lane:

THAT the Agenda for the Regular Meeting of October 2, 2012, be approved as submitted, subject to the addition of Items 4.1 and 7.1, and the removal of Item 8.3 from the Consent Agenda.

The motion was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

3 | AWARDS AND RECOGNITIONS

3.1 LEED Certificate Award

Superintendent Coppinger introduced the item, noting that LEED is awarded by the Canada Green Building Council and it stands for Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design. The Connaught School LEED award marks the first time in Canada for a sandstone modernization project to receive recognition. It is far more difficult to achieve a LEED standard in a modernization project than it is for a new school design. He pointed out that the Chief Superintendent's Update recognizes the work of the Connaught teachers and the CBE EcoTeam to create a series of educational tools and videos connected to student learning outcomes.

Superintendent Coppinger called forward Mr. R. Ashley, Manager, Architectural Engineering Services, Ms. F. McGilvray Cooke, Principal, Connaught School, and Chair Cochrane to receive the LEED Canada Silver Certificate and Plaque.

4 | RESULTS FOCUS

4.1 Vincent Massey School Presentation

Mr. C. Davies, Director of Area IV, introduced the item, noting that the presentation would share the work that is taking place at Vincent Massey School, to develop an informed and engaged community, locally, nationally and globally. This work not only profiles Results 3: Citizenship, but embodies an integration of citizenship with character, personal development and academic success. He introduced Mr. K. Connelly, Principal, and Mr. H. Ahn, Teacher, and welcomed the following co-presenters:

- former Vincent Massey School students: Madison (currently attending Grade 12 student at Western Canada High School), and Caitlin (currently attending Grade 12 student at Ernest Manning High School);
- current Grade 9 Vincent Massey School students: Savannah, Samantha, Millica, Bronson, Mackenzie and Mikaela; and
- current Grade 8 Vincent Massey School students: Solveig and Hayle.

Students expressed their dedication and pride in their contributions through the Legacy Corporation, which is completely student-run. Students learn together about business, leadership and citizenship. Legacy helps students to know more about their school and their fellow students; it is about touching lives and connecting. The students shared their

personal experience and development, their accomplishments, their leadership skills and their goals, along with the experiences of their fellow students, which were depicted in part through videos that they created locally as well as videos that were created by their global partners. The presentation centred on their humanitarian work in partnership with the widows of Uganda, to better the lives of the people of Uganda. This work included: poem writing; song writing; the writing a children's story book; fundraising through bake sales, sales of crafts – including those made by the widows of Uganda, holding multi-cultural fairs, student dances, and through making individual sacrifices each month and donating the money that they would have used to purchase personal products and activities. The proceeds from the student-led fundraisers are put towards the building of a shelter for the homeless that will also house a school; the building of wells to provide clean drinking water; to get health care provided to the people in need; and for the purchase of and donation of educational materials, sports equipment, food and clothing for the people of Uganda.

Mr. Connelly noted that as a new principal at Vincent Massey School he could not take credit for this tremendous work, but he was absolutely thrilled to inherit this legacy. He expressed his pride in the students' work and stated that they have proven to be leaders in our communities and on the global stage. He extended his appreciation to Mr. Ahn for his initiation and dedication to this work with students.

Chair Cochrane thanked the students and staff for the presentation. She commended the students for living the Board's values through their actions and understanding of the rights and responsibilities of citizenship in the local, national and international context.

4.2 R-2: Academic Success – Provincial Achievement Tests and Diploma Exam Results

Chief Superintendent Johnson provided brief highlights of the summary results of the 2011-2012 Provincial Achievement Test and Diploma Examinations. She stated that the provincial testing results for CBE students are exceptional, and we are very proud of the achievement of our students and teachers.

In the 2011-12 school year the participation and overall achievement of CBE students is above that of the province in grades 3, 6, and 9 English Language Arts, French Language Arts, Mathematics, Social Studies and Science. Our year over year results have shown improvement in many areas. Increases in grade 6 Science achievement is particularly noteworthy, as are improvements in grade 3 and grade 6 English and French Language Arts. Our primary area for improvement is in our grade 9 Knowledge and Employability (K&E) curriculum and courses. In the grade 9 K&E provincial achievement tests, both our participation and our achievement are below provincial levels. Initial analysis within the results shows some leading indicators of improvement, but achievement lags behind our expectations. We continue to be challenged in this curriculum area and remain committed to ensuring success for each student. We will be dedicating renewed attention and focus to the teaching and learning in these courses. The results of our English Language Learners (ELL) and Special Education learners continue to be very strong.

Our diploma exam results are above the province in 8 of 11 tests at the acceptable standard, and in 10 of 11 tests at the standard of excellence. At the acceptable standard,

CBE diploma examination results were above the provincial levels in all subjects except English 30-1, English 30-2 and Science 30.

Chief Johnson noted that the dedicated actions of our staff in working with an adjustment and improvement cycle over the past few years has had an impact on learning all around. Although the results in Science 30 still remain below those in the province at both the acceptable standard and the standard of excellence, this is the second area of growth for us. At the standard of excellence, particularly strong results were achieved in Social Studies 30-1 and 30-2, Pure Math, Biology 30, Chemistry 30 and Physics 30. About 40% of CBE students achieved the standard of excellence in these subjects, which range from 7% to 11.5% above the provincial achievement levels.

More and more CBE students are completing high school with a foundation of learning to thrive in life, work and continued learning. High School completion rates within the CBE are up 1.6% from last year and are 2.6 percentage points above our previous three-year average. Our dropout rate has decreased a full percentage point from last year to 3.1%. It must be noted that the relative size of that percentage point is significant, representing a 25% improvement from last year's already strong indicator.

Chief Johnson pointed out that Administration will provide detailed information in each of these subject areas over the next several months as part of the monitoring reports to the Board.

Chair Cochrane noted that in the past, the Board was provided a detailed presentation of these results. In moving forward, the Board will receive a summary of the results at this meeting for information. As the year proceeds, trustees will have ample opportunity to dig deeply into the results of each of the core subject areas as those reports are presented throughout the year by Administration.

Superintendent Faber provided an analysis of the Provincial Achievement Tests and Diploma Exam Results, aided by a PowerPoint presentation. Throughout the analysis she offered additional comments as follows:

- The school by school and jurisdiction by jurisdiction results were released only late this morning. Accordingly, school by school tables and comparisons with results from the other metro boards were not available in time to include with this report, but will be made available.
- With respect to interpreting the participation rate for the Diploma examination results the participation rate reflects the percentage of students enrolled in the third year of high school in the province on September 30th of the reported school year, and who completed the course by August 30th of the reported school year.
- The Accountability Pillar report was referenced. In that report, Alberta Education evaluates the jurisdictions' achievement on provincial achievement tests and diploma exams. Where the CBE's achievement was intermediate or high, we have improved significantly. Where our achievement was already high, we continue to improve.
- An increasing percentage of our students are remaining in schools and as our three-year high school completion rate testifies, an increasing percentage of students are completing high school either with a formal credential or with a certificate of high

school achievement, which provides them with a foundation necessary to go on to post-secondary education and training, whether in the apprenticeship area, entry into college or in a university program.

Trustees posed questions, which were addressed by Administration and are summarized as follows:

- Information about our three-year high school completion rate is included in our annual education results report, and a report will be provided to the Board at the end of November 2012.
- The success of our students, as depicted in these results can be attributed to our Three-Year Education Plan, which is foundational to the Board's results statements and includes: teaching each student to how he or she learns best, building capacity in our staff, engaging our public, and stewarding our resources. Additionally, our schools are specifically setting an achievement goal and an instructional goal, so we are able to focus the whole system and understand the alignment between the work of the school, the classroom, and the larger system.
- It should be noted that the CBE sets the average, having the highest number of students in the province. Our results are above average, which is believed exceptional in itself.
- The CBE educates approximately one-half of the English Language Learners (ELL) students within the entire province and, therefore the CBE drives the result. It was noted important to take into consideration the complexity of our student body, and in making comparison to other school jurisdictions it is not only the numbers that should be viewed but also the depth of the complexities that should be considered. In response to the equation shown of the percentage of these students in the CBE and in the Province, on page 4-4 of the report, Administration noted that they would investigate the actual number of ELL students in the CBE and report that to the Board at a later date.

MOVED by Trustee Ferguson:

THAT the Board of Trustees receives the report titled "Summary of the 2011-2012 Provincial Achievement Test and Diploma Examinations" for information.

The motion was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Recessed: 4:45 p.m.
Reconvened: 4:57 p.m.

5 | **OPERATIONAL EXPECTATIONS**

5.1 **Operational Expectations 7: Asset Protection – Reasonable Interpretation**

Chair Cochrane reminded the Board that criteria against which the Board is to judge this report is whether the Board is satisfied that the Chief Superintendent has conveyed that she reasonably understands the values underlying this Board policy. She noted that any decision or comment of the Board of Trustees around non-approval of the reasonable interpretation, including the indicators, is in no way intended to be a vote of non-confidence for the Chief Superintendent.

Trustees posed questions, which Administration responded to and are summarized as follows:

- With respect to the interpretation and indicator of compliance for policy sub-section 7.1, the best comparator was felt to be the Ontario School Boards Insurance Exchange (OSBIE), which has historically been used as a comparator for the CBE. This is a group of school districts that provides insurance for the majority of school districts in Ontario. Toronto would be one of the larger school districts in that exchange, and it is probably double the size of the CBE. With respect to a question of whether other organizations of comparative size to the CBE outside of Ontario were looked at, it was noted that there are not many comparable organizations that are in our circumstance and of our size. Most of the major school boards in Alberta, including CBE, belong to the Urban School Insurance Consortium (USIC).
- Pertaining to indicator #3 under policy sub-section 7.4, it is a rolling audit of 20% of the schools over a period of five years, and even if the audit was taken five years ago, there would not be a substantial change in the facility condition index, which is the basis used by Alberta Infrastructure to determine the need for deferred maintenance in a particular school. It is not believed that we need a rolling number, as the reflection of the assessment for each of those five years gives us a true reflection of the overall standard of buildings in our system.
- Indicator of compliance #2 for policy sub-section 7.3 is set at 99% as an industry standard, given the intrusion level and the privacy issues that must be managed.
- With respect to policy sub-section 7.4, indicator of compliance #1, the CBE is quite aware that it is unable to meet the benchmark; however, it should be considered that we are in compliance given the amount of funding that we receive from the province for infrastructure maintenance. In regards to a question of how the indicators of compliance give a realistic picture of the condition of CBE facilities, Administration pointed out that the policy as written does not ask what condition our schools are in at any given time, and what is needed. This is, however, captured in the CBE's annual report to the Board, providing a description of the condition of our schools. It was further noted that the implications of the sub-policy are not within the control of the Chief Superintendent, which is the rationale for the interpretation as it is given.
- The indicator of compliance for policy sub-section 7.5 would apply to the organization as a whole, rather than including only those instances that result in court action. There was discussion about the need for such occurrences to be proven through some formal process.

MOVED by Trustee Bowen-Eyre:

THAT the Board of Trustees approves that the Chief Superintendent has reasonably interpreted the provisions of OE-7: Asset Protection, including but not limited to the indicators provided in the report.

MOVED by Trustee Taylor:

THAT the motion be amended to include “with the exception of subsection 7.8”.

Trustee comments in favour of the amendment were as follows:

- there is no information that addresses any instance where there may have been a breach of the policy, and it is important that the indicators not only show the outcomes, but that they also show the results; and
- the indicator of compliance for policy sub-section 7.8 does not provide sufficient information to determine whether or not any action was taken.

Trustee comments in opposition to the amendment included a discussion about whether compliance needed to be measured by results or processes, and support for the three indicators listed was expressed.

Chair Cochrane called for the vote on the amendment.

The amendment was
DEFEATED.

In favour:	Trustee Bazinet Trustee Taylor
Opposed:	Trustee Bowen-Eyre Trustee Cochrane Trustee Ferguson Trustee King Trustee Lane

Trustees debated the main motion and their comments are summarized as follows:

- the report is well written and it restates the values of the Board; and the interpretations are well meaning;
- one must look at the relationship between the interpretation and the indicators, which are believed to make sense as they are written; and
- it is a fairly comprehensive statement of having insurance against the things that you hope would not happen.

Chair Cochrane called for the vote on the motion.

The motion was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

6 | **PUBLIC COMMENT**

7 | **MATTERS RESERVED FOR BOARD ACTION**

7.1 **Update on Activities regarding Disclosure of Expenses and Open Government**

Chair Cochrane shared that in response to the Alberta government's mandate to move towards more transparency, and to make publicly available the expense accounts of elected officials and senior administration, the Board has made two public press releases as follows:

- “The Board of Trustees applauds the Alberta government initiative to improve transparency and accountability by bringing forth a new policy for travel and expense disclosure. The timing and the spirit of this policy is welcome. The Board of Trustees already has plans to review its remuneration policy next month. This work will be enhanced by the clear and specific expectations of this policy. On behalf of trustees, I can say we recognize our duty to be open with expenses. We look forward to formalizing our commitment at a public meeting in October.”
- “The Board of Trustees is accountable to Calgarians for the performance of the Calgary Board of Education. Student learning is our primary responsibility. Our responsibility also includes how we govern the investment of almost \$1.1 billion in the education of more than 107,000 students.

As the province implements new policies for expenses and the disclosure of expenses, the Board of Trustees intends to meet or exceed the province's expectations. During a review of the remuneration policy in October, the Board will address how we comply on an ongoing basis. In the meantime, we will post all trustee travel expenses for the year-ended Aug. 31, 2012. These expenses, which cover the full fiscal year, will be available by Oct. 2, 2012.

In addition to initiatives underway, we will be listening to the community for how we can continually improve the accountability and transparency of the CBE Board of Trustees. We invite the community to share ideas and input.”

Chair Cochrane declared the following items to be adopted as submitted:

8 | **BOARD CONSENT AGENDA**

8.1 **Approval of Minutes**

- Regular Meeting held September 18, 2012

THAT the Board of Trustees approves the Minutes of the Regular Meeting held September 18, 2012, as submitted.

8.2 **EducationMatters Financial Statements as at August 31, 2012**

THAT the Board of Trustees receives the financial report for EducationMatters for information and for the record, in the form as submitted.

- 8.4 Trustee Liaison Report – Alberta School Boards Association (ASBA) Board of Directors
THAT the Alberta School Boards Association (ASBA) liaison report containing the ASBA Board of Directors’ Meeting Highlights dated September 13-14, 2012 be received for information.

9 | **CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT CONSENT AGENDA**

9.1 Chief Superintendent Update

THAT the Board of Trustees receives the report for information, as submitted.

The following item was removed from the Consent Agenda.

8.3 Governance Culture and Board/Chief Superintendent Relationship Governance Policies – Board of Trustees’ Annual Self-Evaluation

MOVED by Trustee King:

THAT the Board approves the Board of Trustees’ self-evaluation report as developed during the evaluation workshop of September 5, 2012 as an accurate accounting of the Board’s performance for the period January 2012 – August 31, 2012.

In response to a trustee question, it was clarified that approval of the motion would not imply approval of the *Issue Referral Form and Process* that is noted at the bottom of page 8-15 of the report.

Trustee comments in support of the motion are summarized as follows:

- The purpose of the assessment is continuous improvement and this initial evaluation will provide a baseline for future Board assessments, so that the Board can assess if, in fact, it is achieving continuous improvement. It is hoped that the noncompliant provisions of policy become the basis for future Board discussion and commitment to corrective action.
- The information that was discussed on September 5th and 6th is documented in this report. The trustees undertook a review of each and every governance culture policy and recorded in this evaluation report only those policies that the Board was not in compliance with.

Trustee comments in opposition to the motion are summarized as follows:

- This is not felt to be an accurate account of the Board’s performance as there is much more to it than what is written in the report.
- Approval of this motion would indicate approval of every statement in the report, which is cause for concern because not all of these statements were agreed to by all trustees at the time that they were discussed.
- The document is strictly negative and while it is commendable to admit faults, it is important to look at the whole picture.

Chair Cochrane called for the vote on the motion.

The motion was
CARRIED.

In favour: Trustee Bowen-Eyre
Trustee Cochrane
Trustee Ferguson
Trustee King
Trustee Lane

Opposed: Trustee Bazinet
Trustee Taylor

10 | **ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Cochrane declared the meeting adjourned at 5:42 p.m.